

PLANNING COMMITTEE MINUTES

Date: Thursday 24 August 2023

Time: 6:30pm

Place: Chigwell Council Parish Offices, Hainault Road, Chigwell, IG7 6QZ

Members present:

Cllr Celina Jefcoate(Chair)

Cllr Rochelle Hodds

Cllr Syed Raza

Cllr Lisa Skingsley Morgan

Members of the public

Fourteen (14)#

#for part of the meeting

Members of the Public and Councillors were asked to note that in accordance with Standing Orders 3 (i) and the Local Government Transparency Code 2015, photographing, recording, broadcasting, transmitting or otherwise reporting the proceeding of a meeting would take place.

Councillors were asked to note that in the exercise of their functions, they must take note of the following: equal opportunities; crime and disorder; human rights; health and safety and biodiversity

MINUTES

PL126/23 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies with given reasons were considered as valid and **ACCEPTED** from Cllrs Chahal Holden, Costa, Phull, Rizvi and Gaffar. No other apologies with or without reasons given were received and/or accepted

PL127/23 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Cllr Jefcoate declared an interest in items 5 (2 Courtland Drive) and 7 (Patsalls) on the grounds of knowing the architect, in items, 5 (2 Courtland Drive) and 16 (Hainault Hall) on the grounds of having had contact from residents regarding them and items 9 (Riverside

Meeting: Planning Committee Date: 24 August 2023

Cottage), 14 (Bramstons), and 17 (New Barns Farm) on the grounds of knowing the applicants.

Cllr Hodds and Cllr Skingsley Morgan declared an interest in item 16 (Hainault Hall) on the grounds of having had contact from residents

All Councillors considered their interest non-pecuniary and remained in the meeting

PL128/23 MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting held 10 August 2023 were AGREED and signed by the Chair

The Chair used her discretion to amend the order of items on the agenda

PL129/23 COMMITTEE COMMENTS

Councillors **CONSIDERED** the suggested wording and **AGREED** they should be adopted as follows as the Committee's default starting position for relevant applications.

Where no Minor developments (1-9) sustainability checklist is provided/where the checklist does not demonstrate sufficient contribution to the net zero objections of EFDC

The Council **OBJECTS** to new development that does not adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and/or fail to make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If however the sustainability checklist is revised to show in excess of 60% of the 40 possible mitigation measures in the sustainability checklist fall into the amber or green selections (Net Zero by 2050/20230) and fulfilling these is made a condition of planning being granted, then the council is willing to waive this objection

Where no Householder sustainability checklist is provided/where the checklist does not demonstrate sufficient contribution to the net zero objections of EFDC

The Council expects householder applications to demonstrate they adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If however a householder sustainability checklist is submitted to show 10 (ten) or more of the possible 19 (nineteen) sustainable design principles and building elements are being adopted and fulfilling these is made a condition of planning being granted, then the council is willing to waive this objection

Where a Householder sustainability checklist is provided that the Council consider makes sufficient contribution to the net zero objections of EFDC

The Council asks that implementing the mitigation measures detailed in the sustainability submission is made a condition of planning being granted

It was further **AGREED** the Proper Officer was delegated to make the same comments on behalf of the committee with the agreement of the Chair if necessary and appropriate.

PL130/23 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

Two MOPs plus a representative of the CRA spoke in objection to item 5 (2 Courtland Drive) and three MOPs plus a representative of the CRA spoke in objection to item 16 (Hainault Hall). A representative of the CRA spoke in objection to item 7 (Patsalls)

To **CONSIDER** the following applications, received for the weeks ending 4 and 11 August 2023

PL131/23 EPF/0625/23 - 2, Courtland Drive, Chigwell, IG7 6PN

Demolition of existing dwelling and replacement with two structures containing a total of 5 new dwellings.

Two MOPs plus a representative of the CRA spoke in objection

Seven letters of objection were received

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **STRONGLY OBJECTS** to this application for the following grounds:

Lack of adequate parking - it is considered the proposal has insufficient parking and thus fails to comply with the requirements of the adopted Local Plan which states the starting point for any new development should be compliance with Essex Parking Standards. The Committee noted that a reduction in parking in Town Centres or urban locations may be considered when practicable and within 400m of a station. It was noted Chigwell is not defined as a Town Centre in the Local Plan and does not meets the criteria to be judged an urban area under the Essex Parking Standards. The Committee further noted the comments of the Planning Inspector when dismissing the appeal against a previous refusal of the same proposal (EPF/1573/20), namely that they were not convinced that a shared basement carpark proposed would be practicable or convenient for the future residents of five separate dwellings. Should the car lift be out of action there is insufficient space on site for the occupiers of five dwellings to park at ground level. Therefore there is an unacceptable risk the proposal will lead to an increase on on street parking.

Highway safety - the Council noted the approval of a single dwelling granted at appeal, specifically condition 13 which requires any gates shall be inward opening only and set back a minimum of 6 metres from the back edge of the carriageway. This application placed the vehicular access at less than 5m from the back edge of the carriageway and the Committee thus considers the proposal is contrary to the policies of the adopted Local Plan

Loss of amenity for neighbours - whilst the Planning Inspector considered the car lift for a single dwelling would not cause an unacceptable disturbance, the Parish consider the use of both the car lift and car turntable necessary for five dwellings would cause an unacceptable disturbance to the occupants of nearby dwellings, most notably No 4, contrary to Policy DM9 of the Local Plan

Impact on the SAC - whilst it was noted the applicant stated a S106 was submitted, no such document was before the Committee. As such, it cannot be assessed whether satisfactory mitigation is proposed

Adverse impact on the character of the area - the Courtland Estate is a unique area of predominantly Arts and Crafts style houses within Chigwell and does not contain any purpose built flatted units. This proposal is considered to adversely impact on the character of the area by increasing the density of dwellings on this site in excess of density found anywhere else on the Courtland Estate.

Flooding risk - whilst not officially designated a flood zone, local Councillors noted the frequent flooding of the road from surface water run off. This alone during periods of heavy rain or in combination with overflow from Chigwell Brook which is in close proximity to the proposed development creates a significant risk of the basement parking being rendered unusable

Sustainability - The Council **OBJECTS** to new development that does not adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and/or fail to make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If however the sustainability checklist is revised to show in excess of 60% of the 40 possible mitigation measures in the sustainability checklist fall into the amber or green selections (Net Zero by 2050/20230) and fulfilling these is made a condition of planning being granted, then the council is willing to waive this objection

To **CONSIDER** the position of this Council in light of the adoption of the Local Plan in regard to the following applications yet to be decided. Although these applications may have been before a previous Council, this Council is not bound by the decisions of any previous Council.

PL132/23 EPF/2113/20 - Hainault Hall, 173 Lambourne Road Chigwell IG7 6JU

Installation of an outdoor swimming pool and hard landscaped surround in the grounds of Hainault Hall. The pool is adjacent to and associated with an annexe to the Hall (under construction).

Three MOPs plus a representative of the CRA spoke in objection

Six letters of objection were received

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **STRONGLY OBJECTS** to this application for the following grounds:

Loss of neighbours' amenity - the committee reviewed evidence submitted that indicated the use of the pool, the removal of screening hedging, obtrusive lighting and noise had significantly impacted on the amenity of the neighbouring properties Surface Water drainage - the failure to incorporate suitable SUDS mitigation and the discharge of untreated water from the pool into the field presents a significant environmental risk

Impact on Green Belt - the discharge of backwash from the pool into the field, the extensive hard standing, the light and chemical pollution and the impact on the openness led the committee to consider the proposal is inappropriate development on Green Belt and causes significant harm to the Green Belt that outweighs any benefit of the provision of outdoor exercise facilities of this nature

Breach of planning condition - The committee saw evidence to show the pool was in use. No evidence could be identified to evidence the works completed to facilitate this comply with condition 3 of EPF/2242/20 (Full photographic details and drawings of the types and colours of the hard surfacing surrounding the pool the external pool lining and the pool furniture shall be submitted to and approved by the LPA in writing prior to the commencement of any works. Reason: To ensure the proposed works preserve the special architectural and historic interest of the building).

PL133/23 <u>EPF/1699/23</u> - 43, Chigwell Park Drive, Chigwell, IG7 5BD

Garage conversion, alterations to existing ground floor extension, first floor rear extension, rear dormer, alterations to roof and outbuilding.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: No Objection. However, it was noted the Council expects householder applications to demonstrate they adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050.

The Council asks that implementing the mitigation measures detailed in the sustainability submission is made a condition of planning being granted

PL134/23 <u>EPF/1738/23</u> - Patashalls, Coach House, Pudding Lane, Chigwell, IG7 6BY

Extensions & alterations to existing dwelling house and demolition of existing stable block with replacement outbuilding - Revised scheme to EPF/0255/23 (Officer Report - Appendix 3).

EPF/1742/23 - Patashalls, Coach House, Pudding Lane, Chigwell, IG7 6BY

Grade II listed building application for extensions & alterations to existing dwellinghouse and demolition of existing stable block with replacement outbuilding (Revised scheme to EPF/1477/22 & EPF/0225/23).

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **OBJECTS** to this application for the following grounds:

The Council **OBJECTS** to applications which may result in inappropriate treatment of a listed building. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. The committee noted the Heritage Officer's comments regarding previously refused applications and that

the law provides that buildings and other structures that pre-date July 1948 and are with the curtilage of a listed building are to be treated as part of the listed building. The committee noted the Planning Inspector's comments when refusing a previous application that, "the stable block contributes to an understanding of the status of the host property" and that its presence and secondary location were, "noteworthy elements".

The committee considers the proposal to demolish the stable block fails to acknowledge the legal status, significance and contribution of the stable block to the setting of Patsalls

The Council **OBJECTS** to applications which may result in inappropriate development in Green Belt whether with or without special circumstances. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. The committee considered the proposed increase in size of the replacement dwelling significantly bigger than that which it replaces and thus consider the proposal inappropriate development in Green Belt.

Whilst the Council objects to the applications, should permission be granted it asks that implementing the mitigation measures detailed in the sustainability submission is made a condition of planning being granted

PL135/23 EPF/1739/23 - Riverside Cottage, Roding Lane, Chigwell, IG7 6BH

Construction of new detached cart lodge.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **OBJECTS** to applications which may result in inappropriate development in Green Belt whether with or without special circumstances. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If, however, all relevant Officers deem this application acceptable, whether with amendments or not, then the council is willing to waive this objection

The Council expects householder applications to demonstrate they adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/ or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If however a householder sustainability checklist is submitted to show 10 (ten) or more of the possible 19 (nineteen) sustainable design principles and building elements are being adopted and fulfilling these is made a condition of planning being granted, then the council is willing to waive this objection

PL136/23 <u>EPF/1327/23</u> - 11, New Forest Lane, Chigwell, IG7 5QN

Extension of existing private residence to form additional and modified room layout including larger kitchen, additional bedroom with associated bathrooms and addition of new small basement area. Modification of existing elevations to suit new proposal including brick cladding and new windows, construction of new wall with railings at pavement line and modifications to hard and soft landscaping associated with proposal.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: No Objection. It was noted the Council expects householder applications to demonstrate they adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the

incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050.

The Council asks that implementing the mitigation measures detailed in the sustainability submission is made a condition of planning being granted

PL137/23 <u>EPF/1693/23</u> - 48, Hainault Road, Chigwell, IG7 6QX

Demolition of existing extensions and erection of single storey rear extension

EPF/1694/23 - 48, Hainault Road, Chigwell, IG7 6QX

Grade II listed building application for the demolition of existing extensions and erection of single storey rear extension

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **OBJECTS** to applications which may result in inappropriate treatment of a listed building. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If, however, all relevant Officers deem this application acceptable, whether with amendments or not, then the council is willing to waive this objection

It was noted the Council expects householder applications to demonstrate they adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050. The Council asks that implementing the mitigation measures detailed in the sustainability submission is made a condition of planning being granted

PL138/23 <u>EPF/1729/23</u> - 17, Brook Way, Chigwell, IG7 6AW

Retrospective application for built outbuilding.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **STRONGLY OBJECTS** to this application for the following grounds:

Character and Appearance - the committee considered the application had failed to satisfactorily address or mitigate the reasons for its previous refusal, namely it was a very prominent and incongruous feature when viewed from both within and outside the site. As such, it considered the proposal remain harmful to the character and appearance of the area and remains contrary to policy DM9 of the adopted Local Plan

Neighbouring Amenities - the committee considered the application had failed to satisfactorily address or mitigate the reasons for its previous refusal, namely it continues to have a visually obtrusive and overbearing impact on 2 Brook Rise and is thus harmful to the amenity of the residents of the property

Sustainability - The Council expects householder applications to demonstrate they adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If however a householder sustainability checklist is submitted to show 10 (ten) or more of the possible

Minutes: Planning Committee Date: 24 August 2023

19 (nineteen) sustainable design principles and building elements are being adopted and fulfilling these is made a condition of planning being granted, then the council is willing to waive this objection

PL139/23 <u>EPF/1735/23</u> - Bramstons, Roding Lane, Chigwell, IG7 6BE

Demolition of existing garage block and construction of new garage block.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **OBJECTS** to applications which may result in inappropriate development in Green Belt whether with or without special circumstances. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If, however, all relevant Officers deem this application acceptable, whether with amendments or not, then the council is willing to waive this objection

It was noted the Council expects householder applications to demonstrate they adequately comply with Policy DM9 iii (sustainable design and construction), DM19 (sustainable water) and/or DM20 (the incorporation of low carbon and renewable energy measures) and make sufficient contribution to meeting the EFDC objective of net zero by 2030 or 2050. The Council asks that implementing the mitigation measures detailed in the sustainability submission is made a condition of planning being granted

PL140/23 <u>EPF/1781/23</u> - 24, Ely Place, Chigwell, IG8 8AG

TPO/EPF/9/11

T14 Oak - Crown reduce to previous points, as specified.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: The Council **OBJECTS** to applications which may result in inappropriate treatment or felling of a protected tree. The Council, therefore, **OBJECTS** to this application. If, however, all relevant Officers deem this application acceptable, whether with amendments or not, then the council is willing to waive this objection

To **NOTE** and **COMMENT** if appropriate, the following Lawful Development Applications - Proposed (prospective applications where works have not yet been carried out). If a property owner wants to be certain that the existing or proposed use or development of a building is lawful for planning purposes or that their proposal does not require planning permission, they can apply for a 'Lawful Development Certificate' (LDC)

PL141/23 None

To **NOTE** and **COMMENT** if appropriate, the following Approval of Details Reserved by A Condition. This type of application is needed where a condition in a planning permission or a listed building consent requires details of a specified aspect of the development which wasn't fully described in the original application. These details need to be submitted for approval before the development can begin

PL142/23 EPF/1765/23 - New Barns Farm, Roding Lane, Chigwell, IG7 6BJ

Minutes: Planning Committee

Minutes: Planning Committee Date: 24 August 2023

Application for approval of detail reserved by condition 3'Additional drawings' and condition 4 'Sample area of pointing' on planning permission EPF/1122/23 (1. Replacement pointing in lime mortar materials on front ground and first floor aspect of house to improve airflow and breathability of brickwork. Sample area of 600mm by 600 mm has been completed and requires visit by Listed Buildings Officer to confirm their approval of the lime mortar mix.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: No Comment as already approved

To **NOTE** and **COMMENT** if appropriate, the following Prior Approval applications. Prior approval is a formal submission to the local planning authority and the purpose of it is to seek confirmation that specified parts of a development are acceptable, before work can commence

PL143/23 EPF/1726/23 - 66, Grange Crescent, Chigwell, IG7 5JF

Prior approval Part 1 Class A.1(ea): Larger home extension - Prior notification for the proposed 6m deep single storey rear extension, height to eaves 3m and maximum 3.30m.

Chigwell Parish Council comment: No Comment

PL144/23 APPEAL COMMENTS

None

PL145/23 ITEMS TO BE BROUGHT FORWARD TO THE NEXT MEETING OR ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION THAT DO NOT REQUIRE A DECISION TO BE MADE

None

PL146/23 DATE OF THE NEXT MEETING

Thursday 14 September at 6.30pm

The meeting closed at 7.26pm